



# Collecting Race Based Data

Over 100 community organizations have endorsed the call urging the Winnipeg Police Service *“to collect race-based data on all police interactions with community members and publicly report disaggregated data on an annual basis.”* This recommendation stems from reports by racialized community members describing incidents of racial profiling and the disproportionate use of intimidation tactics and force by police officers.

---

## A Significant Shift in Support for Collecting Race-Based Data

---

Historically racialized groups have tended to strongly oppose the collection of race based data by different systems, including the justice system, based on the fear that this data would be used to justify and further entrench discriminatory practices. However, there has been a significant shift in this stance. There is growing recognition that we cannot change what we do not measure. Consequently, many Black, Indigenous and People of Colour (BIPOC) are now calling for the collection of race based data as an integral component of strategies to address systemic racism in a broad range of public institutions, including the justice system. In addition to ensuring that the data collection is being driven by the intent of addressing systemic inequities, it is essential for BIPOC communities to be integrally involved in the planning and implementation of data collection strategies to ensure that data is gathered in a culturally safe manner and to mitigate against data misuse that causes harm to BIPOC community members. The collection, use and dissemination of the data must be grounded in a rights-based framework that is consistent with principles of data sovereignty and ownership by BIPOC communities. For example, BIPOC communities were at the forefront of successfully advocating for the collection of race, ethnicity and Indigeneity data on COVID-19 infections in Manitoba. A BIPOC Working Advisory Council was established to guide all aspects of data collection planning and implementation, and was part of the review and approval process prior to the dissemination of reports.

---

## The Winnipeg Police Service Lags Behind

---

Law enforcement agencies in North America, Europe and Latin America have made much more progress in this area than the Winnipeg Police Service. A number of police services in the United States began collecting and reporting race based data over two decades ago. Canadian jurisdictions are starting to follow suit. As detailed in *Appendix* other jurisdictions across Canada are making advances in the collection of race based data with respect to policing and other systems. For example, police forces in Toronto, Ottawa and Halifax have undertaken the collection of race based data. Other systems have also begun collecting race based data to better understand and address system inequities. Manitoba continues to make progress in collecting race based data to respond to the health care needs of BIPOC communities. On May 11<sup>th</sup>, 2023 Shared Health Manitoba began the process of collecting race based data on patients receiving care in hospitals. The recommendations below include emerging best practices, based on findings from an assessment of these initiatives and a growing body of academic literature on race based data collection methods. Of particular note is the comprehensive approach adopted by the Toronto Police Service and the independent assessment conducted by the Ontario Tech/York University Research Team.

---

## Community Engagement & Building Trust – “Nothing about us without us”

---

Undertaking the collection of race based data offers the potential of building bridges between the Winnipeg Police Service and BIPOC community members. By adopting a principled approach that includes collaborating with community members in planning and implementing a race based data collection strategy, the Winnipeg Police Service can begin a process of rebuilding trust and accountability with disaffected BIPOC community members. For this process to be successful, there must be a demonstrated commitment to take timely and effective action to address issues that emerge from an analysis of the data collected.

---

## Recommendations for the Winnipeg Police Service

---

1. Establish a Community Steering Committee (CSC) consisting of BIPOC anti-racism advocates as well as independent experts in criminology and data collection to guide the planning process, as well as the collection and reporting of race based data.
2. The collection, use and dissemination of the data must be grounded in a human rights approach that is consistent with the principles of ownership, control, access, and possession (OCAP®) of data outlined by the First Nations Information Governance Centre. These principles should be extended to other racialized groups.
3. Develop a plan to collect race based data on a range of police interactions including traffic stops, use of force and strip searches on an ongoing basis. The WPS should start with the priorities identified by the CSC and expand the type of interactions measured over time.
4. Incorporate findings from best practices identified in other jurisdictions and the academic literature on the collection, analysis and dissemination of race based data.
5. The data collection methodology and analysis should incorporate an intersectional lens.
6. Data tabulation, analysis and reporting must be undertaken by independent experts that have been identified in collaboration with the CSC.
7. Data collection must be consistent and transparent.
8. Data collection should incorporate the use of service member's perception data, data from official sources, and self-identification data with respect to race identification.
9. Data collection must address potential harms and respect the dignity of community members by incorporating measures that ensure privacy, confidentiality and effective training of staff on data collection.
10. Reports on the data must be publicly shared on an annual basis.
11. The data must be used to enhance accountability and bias free policing. This includes using the data to identify trends and patterns. These findings must be used to assess compliance with policies and procedures and the effectiveness of training. Actions plans must be developed to effectively address identified issues in a timely manner.
12. The collection and reporting of race based data must be undertaken within the existing police budget and should not be used as a justification to further increase the WPS budget.

## Sources

Bryan, Timothy, and Katherine Meritt. *Final Report and Recommendations on the Collection of Race-Based Police Data in Nova Scotia: Submitted to the Wortley Report Research Committee*. 2019 [https://humanrights.novascotia.ca/sites/default/files/final\\_report\\_and\\_recommendations\\_dr.\\_timothy\\_bryan.pdf](https://humanrights.novascotia.ca/sites/default/files/final_report_and_recommendations_dr._timothy_bryan.pdf)

Engel, Robin Shepard, and Jennifer M. Calnon. "Comparing benchmark methodologies for police-citizen contacts: Traffic Stop Data Collection for the Pennsylvania State Police." *Police Quarterly* 7.1 (2004): 97-125. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/239556642\\_Comparing\\_Benchmark\\_Methodologies\\_for\\_Police-Citizen\\_Contacts\\_Traffic\\_Stop\\_Data\\_Collection\\_for\\_the\\_Pennsylvania\\_State\\_Police](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/239556642_Comparing_Benchmark_Methodologies_for_Police-Citizen_Contacts_Traffic_Stop_Data_Collection_for_the_Pennsylvania_State_Police)

First Nations Information Governance Centre, *The First Nations Principles of OCAP*<sup>®</sup>. Note: OCAP<sup>®</sup> is a registered trademark of the First Nations Information Governance Centre (FNIGC) <https://fnigc.ca/ocap-training/>

Foster, Lorne, and Les Jacobs. *Independent Expert Assessment Report: Toronto Police Service Race-Based Data Collection Strategy Phase 1*. Ontario Tech/York University Research Team. 2022. [https://www.tps.ca/media/filer\\_public/1f/e7/1fe76fd7-1bde-4c4d-bd90-091a5ccb5da/2bea48b6-40a7-4f43-ba92-ce59df850c73.pdf](https://www.tps.ca/media/filer_public/1f/e7/1fe76fd7-1bde-4c4d-bd90-091a5ccb5da/2bea48b6-40a7-4f43-ba92-ce59df850c73.pdf)

Foster, Lorne, and Les Jacobs. *Traffic Stop Race Data Collection Project II. Progressing Towards Bias-Free Policing: Five Years of Race Data on Traffic Stops in Ottawa*. 2019. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/344906290\\_Traffic\\_Stop\\_Race\\_Data\\_Collection\\_Project\\_II\\_Progressing\\_Towards\\_Bias-Free\\_Policing\\_Five\\_Years\\_of\\_Race\\_Data\\_on\\_Traffic\\_Stops\\_in\\_Ottawa](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/344906290_Traffic_Stop_Race_Data_Collection_Project_II_Progressing_Towards_Bias-Free_Policing_Five_Years_of_Race_Data_on_Traffic_Stops_in_Ottawa)

Government of Ontario. *Data Standards for the Identification and Monitoring of Systemic Racism*. 2018. [https://files.ontario.ca/solgen\\_data-standards-en.pdf](https://files.ontario.ca/solgen_data-standards-en.pdf)

Ontario Human Rights Commission. *Count Me In! Collecting Human Rights-Based Data*. Ontario Human Rights Commission, 2010. <https://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/count-me-collecting-human-rights-based-data>

Owusu-Bempah, Akwasi, and Paul Millar. "Research Note: Revisiting the Collection of 'Justice Statistics by Race' in Canada." *Canadian Journal of Law and Society/La Revue Canadienne Droit et Société* 25.1 (2010): 97-104. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/254942017\\_Research\\_Note\\_Revisiting\\_the\\_Collection\\_of\\_Justice\\_Statistics\\_by\\_Race\\_in\\_Canada](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/254942017_Research_Note_Revisiting_the_Collection_of_Justice_Statistics_by_Race_in_Canada)

Police Accountability Coalition. *Community Based Organizations Call for Police Accountability and Reallocation of Resources*. 2020. <https://spcw.mb.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Community-Organizations-Call-for-Police-Accountability-and-the-Reallocation-of-Resources-Updated-October-12-2020.pdf>

Province of Nova Scotia. *Wortley Report Update*. 2022. <https://novascotia.ca/just/publications/docs/Wortley-Report-Update.pdf>

Rady Faculty of Health Sciences. *Key Considerations: Race, Ethnicity and Indigenous Identity Data Collection and Use*. <https://umanitoba.ca/health-sciences/sites/health-sciences/files/2022-11/Key%20considerations.pdf>

Ramirez, Deborah, Jack McDevitt, and Amy Farrell. *A Resource Guide on Racial Profiling Data Collection Systems: Promising Practices and Lessons Learned*. US Department of Justice, 2000. <https://www.ojp.gov/pdffiles1/bja/184768.pdf>

Rossiter Jann and Tom Ndekezi. *Confronting Racism with Data: Why Canada Needs Disaggregated Race-Based Data*. Edmonton Social Planning Council. 2021. [https://edmontonsocialplanning.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Race-Based-Data\\_ESPCFeatureReport\\_Feb2021.pdf](https://edmontonsocialplanning.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Race-Based-Data_ESPCFeatureReport_Feb2021.pdf)

Shared Health Manitoba. *Manitoba Hospitals to Begin Collecting Race, Ethnicity and Indigenous Identity Data*. May 3, 2023. <https://sharedhealthmb.ca/news/2023-05-03-rei-update/>

Shiner, M., Delsol, R., & Neild, R. *The Recording of Police Stops: Methods and Issues*. Open Society Foundations. 2020. <https://www.justiceinitiative.org/uploads/785916de-3171-4db7-9e7f-f73543bf382f/the-recording-of-police-stops-methods-and-issues-20200302.pdf>

Smith, Steven K., and Carol J. DeFrances. *Assessing Measurement Techniques for Identifying Race, Ethnicity, and Gender: Observation-Based Data Collection in Airports and at Immigration Checkpoints*. 2003. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/usjusticematls/4/>

Toronto Police Service. *Race & Identity Based Data Collection Strategy: An Integral Part of the Toronto Police Service's Commitment to Equity, Transparency and Accountability*. 2022. [https://www.tps.ca/media/filer\\_public/59/fd/59fd6bc5-efb1-4b34-bba4-acb4efbf38d5/91ebaccd-5e1f-49ad-8fe0-3b37cf22d0dd.pdf](https://www.tps.ca/media/filer_public/59/fd/59fd6bc5-efb1-4b34-bba4-acb4efbf38d5/91ebaccd-5e1f-49ad-8fe0-3b37cf22d0dd.pdf)

University of Manitoba News. *Community Governance Essential for Manitoba's Race-Based Health Data, Speakers Say*. February 10, 2023. <https://news.umanitoba.ca/community-governance-essential-for-manitobas-race-based-health-data-speakers-say/>

# APPENDIX

## Scan on the Collection of Raced Based Policing Data in Canada

City	Currently Collecting	Year Began	Commitment	Publicly Available	Other Systems
Toronto	Yes <sup>1</sup>	2019	Committed	Yes	Health data since May 2020 <sup>2</sup>
Ottawa	Yes <sup>3</sup>	2013	Committed	Yes	Health data since May 2020 <sup>4</sup>
Nova Scotia-Halifax	Yes <sup>5</sup>	2022	Committed	Yes	Health data since 2022 <sup>6</sup>
Calgary	No <sup>7</sup>	2020	Promised	No	Health <sup>8</sup>
Edmonton	No <sup>9</sup>	Not available	Not available	No	Education <sup>10</sup> /Recruitment <sup>11</sup>
Hamilton	Yes <sup>12</sup>	2015	Committed	No	Health data since 2022 <sup>13</sup>
Waterloo	Yes <sup>14</sup>	2021	Committed	Yes	Health <sup>15</sup>
BC-Vancouver, Surrey, Prince George, Nelson, Duncan/North Cowichan	Yes <sup>16</sup>	2022	Committed	Yes	Health <sup>17</sup>
Saskatoon <sup>18</sup>	Yes	Not available	Promised	No	Data relating to <sup>19</sup> victimization or offence
Montreal <sup>20</sup>	No	Not available	No commitment yet	No	Health data since 2021 <sup>21</sup>
Regina	No <sup>22</sup>	Not available	Promised	No	Health data since 2019 <sup>23</sup>
Peel	No <sup>24</sup>	Not available	Promised	No	Health data since 2020 <sup>25</sup>
New Brunswick	No <sup>26</sup>	Not available	Promised	No	None <sup>27</sup>
PEI	No <sup>28</sup>	Not available	None	No	None <sup>29</sup>
Yukon	No <sup>30</sup>	Not available	None	No	Health, Education etc <sup>31</sup>
Winnipeg	No <sup>32</sup>	Not available	None	No	Health data since 2023 <sup>33</sup>

- 
- <sup>1</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/toronto/toronto-police-race-data-individual-commissioner-1.6497638>
  - <sup>2</sup> <https://www.toronto.ca/news/toronto-public-health-releases-new-socio-demographic-covid-19-data/>
  - <sup>3</sup> <https://capitalcurrent.ca/archive/centretownnews/1997-2016/2013/05/23/police-to-begin-race-data-collection-in-late-june/>
  - <sup>4</sup> <https://ottawa.ctvnews.ca/ottawa-public-health-collecting-race-based-data-on-covid-19-no-timeline-for-release-1.4967933>
  - <sup>5</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/nova-scotia/province-accepts-recommendations-to-gather-race-based-information-from-police-stops-1.6569352>
  - <sup>6</sup> <https://novascotia.ca/race-based-health-data/>
  - <sup>7</sup> <https://www.cps-arac.ca/specific-commitments/race-based-data-collection>
  - <sup>8</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/calgary/alberta-race-based-data-collection-but-no-publishing-1.5822148>
  - <sup>9</sup> <https://www.edmontonpolice.ca/CommunityPolicing/CommunityInitiatives/RacebasedDataCollection#:~:text=As%20part%20of%20this%20initiative,for%20this%20new%20reporting%20requirement>
  - <sup>10</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/edmonton/edmonton-public-school-student-race-based-data-1.5734953>
  - <sup>11</sup> <https://www.edmontonpolice.ca/CommunityPolicing/CommunityInitiatives/RacebasedDataCollection>
  - <sup>12</sup> <https://globalnews.ca/news/6505850/hamilton-police-concerns-race-reporting-policy/>
  - <sup>13</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/hamilton/hhs-epic-data-concerns-1.6473349>
  - <sup>14</sup> <https://kitchener.ctvnews.ca/wrps-to-develop-new-policies-to-identify-systemic-discrimination-1.5948544>
  - <sup>15</sup> <https://www.regionofwaterloo.ca/en/health-and-wellness/resources/Documents/Initial-Analysis-of-Socio-Demographic-Indicators-for-COVID-19-Cases.pdf>
  - <sup>16</sup> <https://thediscourse.ca/okanagan/systemic-racism-in-policing-across-unceded-territories-in-b-c-demands-reform-says-human-rights-commissioner>
  - <sup>17</sup> <https://engage.gov.bc.ca/govtogetherbc/engagement/anti-racism-data-legislation>
  - <sup>18</sup> <https://thestarphoenix.com/news/local-news/police-board-discusses-race-based-data-collection-in-saskatoon>
  - <sup>19</sup> <https://thestarphoenix.com/news/local-news/police-board-discusses-race-based-data-collection-in-saskatoon>
  - <sup>20</sup> <https://globalnews.ca/news/6497304/montreal-police-collect-race-based-data/>
  - <sup>21</sup> <https://montrealgazette.com/news/local-news/montreal-groups-to-call-for-release-of-race-based-covid-19-data>
  - <sup>22</sup> <https://www.cjme.com/2020/07/30/police-collecting-racial-data-comes-with-concerns-bray-says/>
  - <sup>23</sup> <https://www.regina.ca/export/sites/Regina.ca/about-regina/community-safety-well-being/.galleries/pdfs/Community-Safety-and-Well-being-Plan.pdf>
  - <sup>24</sup> <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2021/12/23/peel-police-to-collect-race-data-during-traffic-stops-amid-efforts-to-address-disparities.html?rf>
  - <sup>25</sup> <https://www.wellesleyinstitute.com/health/toronto-and-peel-have-reported-race-based-and-socio-demographic-data-now-we-need-action/#:~:text=South%20Asian%2C%20Black%20and%20Latin,report%20their%20data%20in%20Canada.>
  - <sup>26</sup> <https://www2.gnb.ca/content/dam/gnb/Corporate/Promo/systemicracism-racismesystemique/SystemicRacismCommissionerFinalReport.pdf>
  - <sup>27</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/new-brunswick/response-report-systemic-racism-nb-1.6691213>
  - <sup>28</sup> [https://www.princeedwardisland.ca/sites/default/files/publications/police\\_review\\_final\\_report\\_2017.pdf](https://www.princeedwardisland.ca/sites/default/files/publications/police_review_final_report_2017.pdf)
  - <sup>29</sup> <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/prince-edward-island/pei-racism-health-care-1.6176976>
  - <sup>30</sup> <https://yukon.ca/en/policing-priorities#2021%E2%80%9322-policing-priorities>
  - <sup>31</sup> <https://yukon.ca/en/diverse-territory>
  - <sup>32</sup> <https://globalnews.ca/news/7041919/winnipeg-police-collects-shares-ethnicity-data/>
  - <sup>33</sup> <https://winnipeg.ctvnews.ca/manitoba-to-become-first-province-to-collect-race-based-patient-data-1.6382001>